

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE**

ST. CLAIR INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY)	
CONSULTANTS, INC.,)	
)	
Plaintiff,)	
)	
v.)	C.A. No. 09-354-LPS
)	(Consolidated)
ACER, INC., <i>et al.</i> ,)	
)	JURY TRIAL DEMANDED
Defendants.)	
<hr/>		
MICROSOFT CORPORATION,)	
)	
Plaintiff,)	
)	
v.)	C.A. No. 10-282-LPS
)	
ST. CLAIR INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY)	
CONSULTANTS, INC.,)	
)	
Defendant.)	

**DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR SPOILATION SANCTIONS
AGAINST PLAINTIFF**

Defendants Dell Inc., Lenovo (United States), Inc., Acer, Inc., Acer America Corp., Inc.,
Gateway, Inc., Intel Corp., Toshiba Corp., Toshiba America Information Systems, Inc., and
Toshiba America, Inc. and declaratory judgment Plaintiff Microsoft Corp. (collectively,
“Defendants”) respectfully move for spoliation sanctions against plaintiff. The reasons for this
motion are set forth in detail in the accompanying Opening Brief in Support.

For the reasons set forth in the Brief, the motion should be granted.

OF COUNSEL:

Kai Tseng
Craig R. Kaufman
Michael C. Ting
FREITAS, TSENG & KAUFMAN LLP
100 Marine Parkway, Suite 200
Redwood City, CA 94065
Tel: (650) 593-63000
*Attorneys for Defendants Acer Inc.,
Acer America Corporation, and
Gateway, Inc.*

Constance S. Huttner
VINSON & ELKINS LLP
666 Fifth Avenue, 26th Floor
New York, NY 10103
Tel: (212) 234-0040

Christopher V. Ryan
Avelyn Ross
Jennifer Nall
VINSON & ELKINS LLP
2801 Via Fortuna, Suite 100
Austin, TX 78746
Tel: (512) 542-8400
*Attorneys for Defendant Dell, Inc. and
Lenovo (United States), Inc.*

Jeffrey K. Sherwood
Leslie Jacobs
DICKSTEIN SHAPIRO LLP
1825 Eye Street NW
Washington, DC 20006-5403
Tel: (202) 420-3602
*Attorneys for Defendants Toshiba
Corporation, Toshiba America Information
Systems, Inc., and Toshiba America, Inc.*

Respectfully submitted,

POTTER ANDERSON & CORROON LLP

By: /s/ David E. Moore
Richard L. Horwitz (#2246)
David E. Moore (#3983)
Hercules Plaza, 6th Floor
1313 N. Market Street
Wilmington, DE 19899
Tel: (302) 984-6000
rhorwitz@potteranderson.com
dmoore@potteranderson.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Acer Inc.,
Acer America Corporation, Gateway, Inc., Dell,
Inc., Lenovo (United States), Inc., Toshiba
Corporation, Toshiba America Information
Systems, Inc., Toshiba America, Inc. and
Intervenor Intel Corporation*

OF COUNSEL:

Chad S. Campbell
Timothy J. Franks
PERKINS COIE LLP
Suite 2000
2901 N. Central Ave.
Phoenix, AZ 85012
Tel: (602) 351-8000

Michael D. Broaddus
PERKINS COIE LLP
Suite 4800
1201 Third Avenue
Seattle, WA 98101
Tel: (206) 359-8000
Attorneys for Intervenor Intel Corporation

FISH & RICHARDSON P.C.

OF COUNSEL:

Ruffin B. Cordell
Lauren A. Degnan
FISH & RICHARDSON P.C.
1425 K Street, N.W., 11th Floor
Washington, DC
Tel: (202) 783-5070

Dated: May 25, 2012
1061080 / 34449

By: /s/ Tara D. Elliott
William J. Marsden, Jr. (#2247)
Tara D. Elliott (#4483)
FISH & RICHARDSON P.C.
222 Delaware Ave., 17th Floor
Wilmington, DE 19899
Tel: (302) 652-5070
marsden@fr.com
elliott@fr.com

Attorneys for Microsoft Corporation

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE**

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, David E. Moore, hereby certify that on May 25, 2012, the attached document was electronically filed with the Clerk of the Court using CM/ECF which will send notification to the registered attorney(s) of record that the document has been filed and is available for viewing and downloading.

I hereby certify that on May 25, 2012, the attached document was Electronically Mailed to the following person(s):

Richard D. Kirk
Stephen B. Brauerman
The Bayard Firm
222 Delaware Avenue, Suite 900
Wilmington, DE 19899
rkirk@bayardlaw.com
sbrauerman@bayardlaw.com
Attorneys for Plaintiff St. Clair Intellectual Property Consultants, Inc.

Craig R. Kaufman
Kai Tseng
Michael Ting
Freitas, Tseng, & Kaufman LLP
100 Marine Parkway, Suite 200
Redwood Shores, CA 94065
AcerSt.ClairFTBKALL@ftbklaw.com
Attorneys for Defendants Acer, Inc., Acer America Corporation, Gateway, Inc.

R. Terrance Rader
Glenn E. Forbis
Charles W. Bradley
James F. Kamp
Rader, Fishman & Grauer, PLLC
39533 Woodward Avenue, Suite 140
Bloomfield Hills, MI 48304
stclairteam@raderfishman.com
Attorneys for Plaintiff St. Clair Intellectual Property Consultants, Inc.

Timothy S. Teter
Elizabeth Stameshkin
Matthew J. Brigham
Benjamin G. Damstedt
Sriranga Veeraraghavan
Jesse Dyer
Cooley LLP
Five Palo Alto Square
3000 El Camino Real
Palo Alto, CA 94306
st.clair-apple-team@cooley.com
Attorneys for Defendant Apple Inc.

Christopher V. Ryan
Jennifer L. Nall
Jeffrey T. Han
Vinson & Elkins LLP
2801 Via Fortuna, Suite 100
Austin, TX 78746
st.clair-dell-grplist@velaw.com
stclair-levonoteam@velaw.com
*Attorneys for Defendant Dell Inc. and
Lenovo (United States) Inc.*

Kimball R. Anderson
Winston & Strawn LLP
35 W. Wacker Drive
Chicago, IL 60601-9703
kanderson@winston.com
Attorneys for Defendant Dell Inc.

Chad S. Campbell
Timothy J. Franks
Perkins Coie LLP
2901 N. Central Avenue, Suite 2000
Phoenix, AZ 85012-2788
perkins-intel-stclair@perkinscoie.com
Attorneys for Intervenor Intel Corporation

William J. Marsden , Jr.
Fish & Richardson, P.C.
222 Delaware Avenue, 17th Floor
Wilmington, DE 19801
Microsoft-St.ClairFRTTeam@fr.com
Attorneys for Microsoft Corporation

Constance S. Huttner
Vinson & Elkins LLP
666 Fifth Avenue, 26th Floor
New York, NY 10103
st.clair-dell-grplist@velaw.com
stclair-levonoteam@velaw.com
*Attorneys for Defendant Dell Inc. and Lenovo
(United States) Inc.*

Jeffrey K. Sherwood
Leslie L. Jacobs, Jr.
Cameron W. Westin
Dickstein Shapiro LLP
1825 Eye Street NW
Washington, DC 20006-5403
Toshiba-St.Clair@dicksteinshapiro.com
*Attorneys for Defendants Toshiba
Corporation, Toshiba America Information
Systems, Inc., and Toshiba America, Inc.*

Michael D. Broaddus
Perkins Coie LLP
1201 Third Avenue, Suite 4800
Seattle, WA 98101
perkins-intel-stclair@perkinscoie.com
Attorneys for Intervenor Intel Corporation

Ruffin B. Cordell
Lauren A. Degnan
Fish & Richardson, P.C.
1425 K Street, N.W., 11th Floor
Washington, DC 20005
Microsoft-St.ClairFRTTeam@fr.com
Attorneys for Microsoft Corporation

/s/ David E. Moore
Richard L. Horwitz
David E. Moore
POTTER ANDERSON & CORROON LLP
Tel: (302) 984-6000
rhorwitz@potteranderson.com
dmoore@potteranderson.com